

City of Prescott
Prescott Preservation Commission



November 3, 2023 | 9:00 AM
201 N. Montezuma Street
Council Chambers, 3rd Floor
Prescott, AZ 86301

MINUTES

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Mirco called the meeting to order at 9:01 A.M.

2. ROLL CALL

Members:

Michael Mirco, Chairman
Mike King, Vice Chairman
Rob Johnson
Diane Travis
James McCarver
Richard Sprain
Mary Ann Suttles

Staff:

Kaylee Nunez, Historic Preservation Specialist
George Worley, Planning Manager
Sarah Hilton, Recording Secretary

City Leadership:

Mayor Phil Goode
Councilman Eric Moore

3. DISCUSSION & ACTION ITEMS

- A. Approval of the August 11, 2023 Prescott Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes.

**MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SUTTLES TO APPROVE AUGUST 11, 2023 MINUTES;
SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SPRAIN: (7-0)**

- B. **HP23-011** - A Request for Approval to Replace 22' W x 6' H Wall Mounted Directional Sign for Sharlot Hall Museum.

Kaylee Nunez, Historic Preservation Specialist stated that the request is for a replacement directional sign for Sharlot Hall Museum. She stated that the subject building is on the northwest corner of Gurley and Montezuma Streets. She then presented historic photos of the subject building.

Ms. Nunez presented an aerial map showing the location of the building and stated that the sign will be on the north wall of said building. She then presented photos of the

current sign and a rendering of the replacement sign. She stated that the sign has degraded and part of it has fallen off. She stated that the replacement sign is 22' wide by 6' high with an arrow pointing to the west.

Ms. Nunez reviewed the project against Ch 8 (Courthouse Plaza District) of Prescott's Historic Preservation Master Plan which, in part, states:

- Use historically consistent signage; use only flat against the building.
- Use only integral and natural colors of a neutral tone, compatible with the building and the District.
- Promote continued use of the Courthouse Plaza Historic District as a cornerstone commercial and business area with historically consistent and compatible development.

Ms. Nunez stated that the proposed signage will not compromise the historic integrity of this building.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER KING TO APPROVE HP23-011; SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TRAVIS: (7-0)

- C. **HP23-009** - Approval of an After-the-Fact Stucco & Metal Perimeter Fencing with Proposed Modifications and Two (2) After-the-Fact 10' W x 9' D x 10' H Ramadas.

Chairman Mirco asked if the applicant was present.

Ms. Nunez stated that the applicant was not present nor was his representation. She stated that the applicant asked for a deferral the day before the meeting.

Commissioner James McCarver asked if the applicant did work without submitting permits to the City.

Ms. Nunez stated that the applicant did the work without obtaining permits and without going to Preservation Commission in approximately late spring. City Staff issued a stop work order and the City has been working with the applicant to bring him before the Preservation Commission as well as get him the needed permits.

Ms. Nunez presented an aerial map to show the location of the property. She then presented photos of the projects that were completed. She stated that there are three units on the property. The ramadas are approximately 10' wide x 10' high x 9' deep. They are wood construction and painted white with grey shingles and black hardware. They do not have footings; they are fastened to the pavers. The fencing ranges from approximately 2 ½' to 3' tall and has a stucco base and stucco columns with CMU caps. Ms. Nunez stated that the railing is horizontal black square tube spanning between columns.

Ms. Nunez presented a site plan that was submitted by the applicant. She stated that the gazebos do not meet the side setback of seven feet according to zoning code. The proposed modification is to place horizontal planks over the black metal railing to emanate a split rail fence.

Analysis:

- The home is within two districts: East Prescott National & Southeast Prescott Local Historic Districts. The home itself is not on the National Register.

The project was reviewed against Ch. 10 (East Prescott) of Prescott's Historic Preservation Master Plan (HPMP) which in part states:

- Encourage wrought iron and open wood fencing at front of property.
- Other walls are constructed of concrete and either left as-is or covered with stucco...corner pillars and caps are encouraged.
- New construction, additions, or alterations should be compatible with neighboring structures as well as streetscape and historic siting.
- Buildings usually have additions to rear of property, maintaining the historic front façade. Proposed new buildings and rehabilitation projects should continue to emphasize existing scale and massing of neighborhood.

Ms. Nunez stated that her analysis is that the stucco walls are compatible with the home itself as it is mid-century and there are several other stucco walls within both districts. The CMU caps and modern metal railings are not compatible. The style & materials of the ramadas are appropriate for Districts, however, siting is not.

Ms. Nunez stated that the proposed modification for fencing is an improvement because it emanates cedar split rail fence which is period and style appropriate for the home.

Commissioner Rob Johnson asked if the applicant would have to make modifications even if approved at Preservation Commission and asked if the applicant had submitted any changes to his original submittal.

Ms. Nunez stated that there is a permit that has been submitted, however they brought it to Preservation first because if it is denied then the permit would be invalid.

Commissioner Mary Ann Suttles asked if the owner does not comply will they get fined or have to come back through Preservation Commission.

Ms. Nunez stated that the fine would be double fees applied on the building permit. She stated that if it is denied at Preservation Commission the applicant would have to take the project down.

George Worley, Planning Manager stated that if an applicant starts building and then applies for a permit after the fact the fine is double fee on the permit. He stated that if they do not comply with requirements, they will be prosecuted for violation of City Code which will go to court and the applicant may receive fines of up to \$2,500 per day.

Chairman Mirco asked if the ramadas meet code.

Mr. Worley stated that they do not meet zoning setback requirements and they have not had a permit issued for them yet.

Chairman Mirco stated that the ramadas are attached to the pavers which are only approximately four inches thick so he is worried that the gazebos could be blown away with a strong gust of wind.

Mr. Worley stated that they do not meet code yet, but they need approval from the Preservation Commission and then they would have to review the building permit application and potentially a Variance application to reduce setbacks.

Commissioner Johnson asked if the project is denied by the Preservation Commission what will happen next.

Mr. Worley stated that the applicant would be required to remove the structures and failure to do so would result in prosecution by the City.

Ms. Nunez stated that the gazebos are classified as accessory structures that are less than 200 square feet which do not require a full building permit, only a site approval permit which evaluates the placement. She stated that the applicant will have to meet the setbacks but that he does not have to meet full International Residential building code.

Commissioner Sprain asked what the setbacks are for the gazebos.

Ms. Nunez stated that the setbacks are seven feet, and the gazebos are at 5 feet currently.

Chairman Mirco stated that the setbacks would put the gazebos right up against the house.

Commissioner McCarver asked if the gazebos are the only portion of the project that do not meet code.

Ms. Nunez stated that is correct. The fence meets code requirements.

Chairman Mirco stated that he believes the fencing is appropriate for the area.

Commissioner Johnson asked if the owner has plans to eliminate the steel structure between the posts of the fence.

Ms. Nunez presented the fencing modification rendering and stated that the applicant is proposing to mount planks on the front of the railing to conceal it.

Chairman Mirco asked if the Commission could ask the applicant to remove the metal railing.

Ms. Nunez stated that they could, but it would affect functionality as the applicant is using it to keep animals in the yard.

Chairman Mirco stated that there are open areas in the fence already and that the fence doesn't work to keep animals in as it is.

Commissioner Johnson stated that he believes the gazebos should be removed. He stated that the applicant should be at the meeting so that the Commission can speak to him about their concerns.

Commissioner King stated that the Commission does not have all of the information and he believes they should defer until there is a representative present.

Commissioner McCarver stated that he would like to deny the request as it does not meet requirements.

Commissioner Sprain asked if the applicant has addressed how the gate would be fixed to meet requirements.

Ms. Nunez stated that it is part of the fencing and would have to be altered as well.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER MCCARVER TO DENY HP23-009; SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER SUTTLES: (5 - 2)

4. STAFF UPDATES

Ms. Nunez stated that she went to the State Preservation Conference with Commissioner Travis and Commissioner McCarver. She stated that the State Master Plan is being updated. She stated that the 2024 State Preservation Conference will be in Prescott in late June. She stated that she would like to get all of the Commissioners involved and is gathering ideas for tours.

Mr. Worley stated that Ms. Nunez was asked to do a presentation at the Conference.

Commissioner Travis stated that the presentation went very well.

Commissioner McCarver stated that he went to several talks at the conference.

5. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to discuss, Chairman Mirco adjourned the meeting at 9:40 A.M.


MICHAEL MIRCO, Chairman

ATTEST:



SARAH HILTON, Recording Secretary