



City of Prescott

Prescott Preservation Commission

April 12, 2024 | 9:00 AM
201 N. Montezuma Street
Council Chambers, 3rd Floor
Prescott, AZ 86301

MINUTES

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Mirco called the meeting to order at 9:00 A.M.

2. ROLL CALL

Members:

Michael Mirco - Chair
Mike King - Vice Chair
Diane Travis – Member
James McCarver - Member
Rob Johnson – Member
Richard Sprain – Member (Absent)
Mary Ann Suttles – Member

3. DISCUSSION & ACTION ITEMS

- A. Approval of the March 8, 2024 Prescott Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SUTTLES TO APPROVE THE MARCH 12, 2024 MINUTES; SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER JOHNSON: (6 - 0)

- B. **HP24-005:** Request to Remove Existing Deck in Rear of Home & Add 166 Square Foot Den with Access Ramp in its Place. Preservation Districts: Southeast Prescott Local & Joslin Whipple National. Zoning: SF-9 (Single Family-9). Property Owner: Cottage Trust- Arlene Gibbs. Applicant: Shelton & Associates LLC. Location: APN 110-03-004, 306 S Mt Vernon Ave.

Historic Preservation Specialist, Kaylee Nunez stated that the Commission saw another proposal for this property in January for replacement fencing in the front side yard. She presented an aerial map to show the location of the subject property.

Ms. Nunez stated that the home was built in approximately 1914 and is bungalow style. She stated that it is in the Southeast Prescott Local Register District and the Joslin Whipple National Register District.

Proposal:

- Demolish existing 162 sq ft deck & ramp on northeast corner (rear) of home.
- 160 sq ft den with new ramp to be constructed in its place.
- Eight inch engineered wood lap siding painted to match existing.
- Double hung Andersen Fibrex windows.
- Architectural grade shingles to match existing.
- Gable style roof with west facing profile to match existing, adjacent roof plane.

Ms. Nunez presented renderings of the existing and proposed elevations.

Design reviewed against Chapter 10 (East Prescott National Historic District) of The Historic Preservation Master Plan. Chapter 10, in part, states:

- Encourage scale consistent with existing structures and styles
- Use gable and hip roofs consistent with historic pattern
- Additions to existing buildings should be to the rear of the property to maintain the front façade
- Encourage "architectural style" asphalt roofing material
- Double-hung windows are the most common with a predominant pane design of "one-over-one" for all architectural styles
- Exterior walls of most contributing buildings are sheathed with wood siding in a clapboard, beveled or shiplap design

Ms. Nunez stated that weighing it against those criteria, the proposed changes to the rear of the home will not impact its historic status nor the historic integrity of the Districts it is within.

Ms. Nunez presented a floor plan of the project.

Commissioner Jim McCarver asked if the roof would be visible from the street.

Trinidee Shelton, Architect for the project, stated that the new roof will not be visible from the front of the home and there are fences protecting the view from the next door neighbor as well. She stated that the vision toward this property from the neighbors will be limited if at all.

Chairman Mirco stated that he drove by the property and could not see anything in the back of the home.

Ms. Shelton stated that one of the challenges they find when adding on to historic homes is designing an addition that doesn't look like an afterthought. She stated that there are existing fascia lines that need to continue and also respect the historic requests of continuing gable end lines where they exist. She stated that a lower profile or lower slope roof like the one in the project is not ideal but they will tie it into another low slope roof that exists at the back. She stated that it is an addition in the exact footprint of the existing uncovered deck is and that the view of the addition in the back will be nearly impossible to see from anywhere around

the property.

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER KING TO APPROVE HP24-005 REQUEST TO REMOVE EXISTING DECK IN REAR OF HOME & ADD 166 SQUARE FOOT DEN WITH ACCESS RAMP IN ITS PLACE; SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TRAVIS: (6 - 0)

- C. **HP24-006:** Request for Approximately 21 Square Feet of New Wall Mounted Signage for Black Arrow Jewelry & Art Gallery. Preservation Districts: Courthouse Plaza Local & National Zoning, DTB (Downtown Business). Property Owner: Nelson Family Trust. Applicant: A & B Sign Co. Location: APN 113-15-117, 124 W Gurley Street.

Ms. Nunez stated that the project is at the northeast corner of the Gurley Street and Montezuma Street intersection. She presented a historic photo from 1904. She stated that the building was built in 1901. She stated that it is not a National Register contributor due to significant changes to the front and side façade but is within the Courthouse Plaza Local and National Historic Districts.

Ms. Nunez presented an aerial map to show the location.

Proposal:

- Install new lettering spelling 'Black Arrow – Jewelry & Art Gallery' with aluminum decorative arrow (21 sq ft).
- Plastic formed, bevel faced lettering to be mounted with studs.
- Black metal gooseneck light fixtures mounted above to illuminate.

Ms. Nunez presented a rendering of the sign provided by the sign contractor.

Design reviewed against Chapter 8 (Courthouse Plaza Local & National Historic Districts) of the Historic Preservation Master Plan. Ch. 8, in part, states:

- Use only integral and natural colors of a neutral tone, compatible with the building and the district.
- Promote continued use of the Courthouse Plaza Historic District as a cornerstone commercial and business area.
- Signage should complement, and not detract, from the building....signage shall be used for identification only.

Ms. Nunez stated that the proposed signage will not impact the historic status of the building nor the integrity of the Districts.

Chairman Mirco asked if the lettering will be attached to the black marquis above the awning.

Bryan Wieweck with A&B Signs stated that the sign will be attached to the fascia of the building, which will be painted black.

Chairman Mirco asked if they are painting the building black and applying the white letters.

Mr. Wieweck replied yes.

Chairman Mirco asked if the sign will have a stand-out arrow.

Mr. Wieweck stated that the arrow is dimensional.

Commissioner McCarver asked if there are requirements for the size of the sign compared to the amount of space that they have.

Ms. Nunez stated that the size of the sign is more of a Planning & Zoning question, which will be evaluated when permits are submitted. She stated that the sign is over the allotment so it will have to be scaled down to approximately 13 square feet. She stated that the design will remain the same.

Commissioner McCarver stated that there is only one other business on Gurley on the block that has gooseneck lamps. He asked if there are requirements as the neck of the lamps extends above the top of the building. He stated that he believes the neck should be below the roofline.

Ms. Nunez stated that the guidelines specify prohibiting signage projecting above the roof plane but does not address lighting fixtures.

Chairman Mirco stated that the black color is overwhelming. He asked if there is another color they can use.

Mr. Wieweck stated that he is only the sign contractor and is not painting the building.

Ms. Nunez stated that they cannot govern paint colors, however, she will make recommendations as she does feel that it is a bit harsh.

Commissioner King stated that the proposed sign is 21 sq ft and the new sign would be 13 sq ft and asked if the black would be as big as they currently see it.

Ms. Nunez stated that the whole front façade will be painted black.

Commissioner King asked if the 13 square feet applies to just the letters.

Ms. Nunez stated that, with an irregular shaped sign, they have to draw a box around the sign elements to calculate square footage.

Commissioner King stated that the color of the building is not within the Commission's jurisdiction but that staff will make a recommendation.

Ms. Nunez stated that is correct.

Commissioner McCarver stated that there is a precedent set with Colt Barbecue downtown for the black paint color.

Ms. Nunez stated that the previous Chairman of Preservation Commission saw Colt Barbecue come through and he expressed concerns about the black brick. She stated that black is not a color that was used at the time these buildings were first built.

Commissioner McCarver stated that he does not understand why color recommendations are not a part of what the Commission does.

Ms. Nunez stated that it is not in the guidelines and that they are only allowed to address items that require permits.

**MOTION BY COMMISSIONER TRAVIS TO APPROVE HP24-006 WITH
SCALED DOWN SIGN AT 13 SQUARE FEET; SECONDED BY
COMMISSIONER SUTTLES: (5-1)**

Commissioner McCarver stated that he still has concerns with the gooseneck lighting.

Ms. Nunez stated that can be part of a side discussion with the owner.

Commissioner Suttles stated that the property is not in the Local and National Preservation zoning.

Ms. Nunez stated that it is within two Historic Districts. She stated that the Commission evaluates projects for properties in the Local Districts and National Districts trigger and administrative review.

Commissioner Suttles asked if all the businesses around the Courthouse are in the districts.

Ms. Nunez stated that they are.

4. STAFF UPDATES

Ms. Nunez stated that at the May 10th Preservation Commission meeting, the Commission will be doing a study session for the old City Hall redevelopment.

Commissioner Suttles stated that this project will take more than a meeting or two.

Ms. Nunez stated that they are planning to at least do a study session followed by a voting session as well as additional public outreach.

Commissioner Suttles stated that she believes this project will take some time and she would like to be aware of how long the process may be.

Ms. Nunez stated that the Commission controls the number of meetings and that they can request an additional study session if they feel it is necessary. She stated that they may have to call a special session as well. She stated that staff does not want to rush it due to the gravity of it and the importance to the community.

Commissioner King asked if Commissioner Suttles was asking about the meeting time or the number of meetings.

Commissioner Suttles replied that she is concerned with the number of meetings as she does not believe they can make a decision in one voting meeting.

Commissioner King stated that the Commission made a decision on the Plaza Hotel and it was appealed. He stated that he has had a lot of questions on scale and massing and he believes that every member of the Commission needs to be an expert on scale and massing.

Ms. Nunez stated that she will be meeting with Commissioners individually to make sure they are all informed.

Ms. Nunez stated that Historic Preservation Conference planning is still underway and will be held June 25th-28th in Prescott. She stated the most important thing for the Commission is to attend the conference. She stated that there are six tours set up. She stated that representatives from the National Preservation Network present.

Chairman Mirco thanked Vice Chair King for speaking at the City Council meeting regarding the Plaza Hotel and stated that it was very powerful.

5. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to discuss, Chairman Mirco adjourned the meeting at 9:30 A.M.



MICHAEL MIRCO, Chairman

ATTEST:



SARAH HILTON, Recording Secretary

Marilyn Whisenand

6/14/2024